



**AGRICULTURE AND FOOD DEVELOPMENT AUTHORITY**

1  
2  
3  
4

This article is provided by the author(s) and Teagasc T-Stór in accordance with publisher policies.

Please cite the published version.

The correct citation is available in the T-Stór record for this article.

5

NOTICE: This is the author's version of a work that was accepted for publication in International Journal of Agricultural Management . Changes resulting from the publishing process, such as peer review, editing, corrections, structural formatting, and other quality control mechanisms may not be reflected in this document. Changes may have been made to this work since it was submitted for publication. A definitive version was subsequently published in International Journal of Agricultural Management, 2012, 1(4), 41-47. This is available online at [www.ingentaconnect.com](http://www.ingentaconnect.com).

6  
7

This item is made available to you under the Creative Commons Attribution-Non commercial-No Derivatives 3.0 License.

8



9

# Intra-national importation of pig and poultry manure: acceptability under EU Nitrates

## Directive constraints

### Abstract

Matching the agronomic limits of manure spread lands from housed animal units is an international concern where receiving lands can become over supplied and lead to water quality problems where eutrophication is a risk. Across the EU, this means establishing policy to export manures to off-farm spread lands under tight regulation. Transitional arrangements across, for example, the Republic of Ireland between 2006-2010 allowed pig and poultry manures to be spread subject only to the nitrogen amendment limits of the EU Nitrates Directive and not the phosphorus limits. From 2013 this arrangement is to be phased out, and pig and poultry producers have consequently expressed concerns about the availability of recipient spread lands for these manures. Using a national farm survey and a multinomial model this paper investigates the willingness of the farming population to import these manures. Results indicate that between 9 and 15 per cent of farmers nationally would be willing to pay to import these manures; a further 17-28 per cent would import if offered on a free of charge basis. Demand is strongest among arable farmers, younger farmer cohorts and those of larger farm size with greater expenditure on chemical fertilisers per hectare and who are not restricted by a Nitrates Directive derogation. The nature of this demand could assist in achieving environmental goals under the EU Nitrates and Water Framework Directives.

**Keywords:** Pig and poultry manure, willingness to import, multinomial logit model.

## 33 1. Introduction

34

35 The 1991 Nitrates Directive (ND) is one of the earliest pieces of EU legislation aimed at  
36 controlling and improving water quality. The ND aims to minimise surplus phosphorus (P) and  
37 nitrogen (N) losses from agriculture to the aquatic environment by constraining use to  
38 agronomic optima and limiting to periods where mobilisation during runoff events is minimised.  
39 The Directive was implemented in the Republic of Ireland through Statutory Instrument (S.I.)  
40 378 of 2006, and updated in Statutory Instrument 101 of 2009 (Government of Ireland, 2006;  
41 2009). Commonly referred to as the Good Agricultural Practice (GAP) regulations, these gave  
42 statutory effect to Ireland's national ND National Action Programme. The GAP regulations  
43 mandate a minimum slurry storage requirement for the housing of livestock over the winter  
44 period and closed periods for spreading organic manures during autumn and winter months.  
45 Limits on livestock intensity are also implemented to indirectly constrain organic N use to 170 kg  
46 organic N ha<sup>-1</sup> per annum and up to 250 kg N ha<sup>-1</sup> per annum where a derogation has been  
47 granted<sup>1</sup> (see Fealy et al., 2010 for a more detailed review of ND regulation requirements). The  
48 application limit of chemical fertilizers is recommended by crop type at rates defined by crop  
49 demand (Coulter and Lawlor, 2008). A restriction on spreading according to a P limit is primarily  
50 related to a soil P index system which is based on the measured concentration of available P in  
51 soil as determined by the Morgan's P test (Morgan, 1941; Schulte et al., 2010).

52

53 Export-import of housed animal manures is common throughout the EU and other countries  
54 especially for intensive systems such a pig and poultry. In areas of intense pig and poultry  
55 production over fertilisation of land locally can result in negative environmental consequences  
56 for water quality (Langeveld et al., 2007). Application of these manure to suitable spread lands  
57 with correspondent nutrient demand is a challenge across many developed countries (Teira-  
58 Esmatges and Flotats, 2003; Adhikari et al., 2005; Paudel and McIntosh, 2005; Biberacher et al.,  
59 2009 Paudel et al., 2009;) especially in the EU with the advent of the Nitrates and Water

---

<sup>1</sup> A total of 4,190 farmers secured Derogation in 2010. This equates to 3 per cent of the population. Statistics from the Teagasc National Farm Survey 2009 ( EU Farm Accountancy Data Network based) indicate a mean organic N and P across all farm systems of 95 kg Ha<sup>-1</sup> and 14 kg Ha<sup>-1</sup> respectively (Teagasc, 2010).

60 framework Directives (Van der Straeten et al. 2010; Schroder and Verloop 2010; Warneck et al.,  
61 2010; Jacobson, 2011).

62  
63 Across the Republic of Ireland a four year transitional arrangement between 2006-10 applied to  
64 pig and poultry manures as well as spent compost from the mushroom (SMC) industry (Schulte,  
65 et al., 2010). This transitional arrangement allowed these manures to be spread subject only to  
66 the N part of the regulation and not the P limits of the Directive. The Nitrates Action Programme  
67 was reviewed in 2010, and a second Action Programme has come into effect through S.I. 610 of  
68 2010 (Government of Ireland, 2010). In the second programme, the transitional arrangements  
69 for pig and poultry manure and spent mushroom compost (SMC) were extended until 31  
70 December 2012. However, from 1 January 2013 onwards, spreading of pig and poultry manure  
71 and SMC will be subject to maximum available P application rates. Starting from 2013, P in  
72 these organic manures may only be applied at excess rates of  $5 \text{ kg ha}^{-1}$ ; from 1 January 2015 this  
73 surplus will be reduced to  $3 \text{ kg ha}^{-1}$ , and from the 1 January 2017 the transitional arrangements  
74 will end, with no further P excess allowed for pig and poultry manure or SMC. The short-term  
75 extension of transitional period effectively recognised the difficulties that implementing the  
76 regulations would have on the pig and poultry sectors.

77  
78 The phasing out of the transitional arrangements will impose significant restrictions on the use  
79 of grassland as recipient land for pig and poultry slurry. It is estimated that this could lead to a  
80 50 per cent increase in the land area required for application of this manure (Schulte et al.,  
81 2010). From 2013 onwards, where recipient grassland fields are assumed to be in the optimum  
82 target Soil P Index 3 ( $5.1\text{-}8.0 \text{ mg l}^{-1}$  available P for grass soils)<sup>2</sup>, the annual 'maximum fertilisation  
83 rate' of P is restricted to between  $15$  and  $29 \text{ kg ha}^{-1}$ , depending on Nitrates Derogation and  
84 prevailing stocking rate. However, once P inputs from livestock and purchased concentrates<sup>3</sup>  
85 are counted and deducted from the maximum annual total P input, the amount of P that may

---

<sup>2</sup> Greater quantities are allowed where the field soil P index is sub-optimal level (index 1 and 2), no P is allow where soil P status is enriched at index 4. Refer S.I. No 610 of 2010 for detail of allowances.

<sup>3</sup> Under Nitrates regulations in the Republic of Ireland (S.I. 610 of 2010) the P content of imported feedstuffs is set at  $0.5 \text{ kg P}$  in respect of each  $100 \text{ kg}$  except where the actual P content is known and provided by the supplier. There is hence an incentive to import lower P content feedstuffs.

86 be brought onto these grassland based holdings in the form of either chemical fertiliser or  
87 externally produced slurry / manure is likely to be minimal. This is in contrast to arable or root  
88 crop area where depending on the crop sown, and assuming P index 3 (6.1-10.0 mg l<sup>-1</sup> available  
89 P for arable soils), maximum fertiliser rates range from 20 to 100 kg ha<sup>-1</sup> (Government of  
90 Ireland, 2010).

91  
92 Farms generating excessive supplies of N and P can either reduce production, export surpluses  
93 as processed or unprocessed manure. Burton and Turner (2003) note that the redistribution of  
94 surpluses is a particular issue in a number of EU countries ( or regions therein) where local  
95 manure surpluses are particularly large due to intensive production (e.g. - Netherlands, Denmark,  
96 Belgium). Netherlands pioneered the development of a sophisticated system for distribution,  
97 control and accounting of manure from the livestock intense southern region to the more arable  
98 north. Van der Straeten et al (2010) notes the issue can be viewed as an allocative problem.  
99 Affected farmers have limited spread lands and assuming no decrease in production, are faced  
100 with two allocation options; transporting manure to other farmers' land or processing manure.  
101 The most common processing options include separation, anaerobic digestion and  
102 nitrification/de-nitrification. Teagasc Pig Development Unit (2009) notes denitrification  
103 /nitrification is only relevant when there is no economical solution to excess organic N and  
104 anaerobic digestion has nothing to offer in dealing with excess N and P. Separation of the slurry  
105 into a liquid nitrogen rich fraction and solid based phosphorus rich fraction, which is exported  
106 from the farm, has been discussed in the literature (Schroder and Verloop 2010; Jacobson, 2011).  
107 The P rich solid fraction is less bulky and can be exported at lower costs to arable farms as a  
108 substitute for chemical P fertilizer. Livestock farms could substitute the N rich liquid fraction for  
109 chemical N fertilizer. Because of the high density of pigs and cattle in some EU regions, manure  
110 processing has become more prevalent. In many cases after separation the P-rich solid fraction is  
111 composted before being exported long distances to cropland , however, land application is more  
112 difficult requiring specialist equipment (Butron and Turner, 2003; Teagasc Pig Development Unit,  
113 2009). While processing offers an alternative to transporting slurry, it is capital and energy  
114 intensive (Lopez-Ridaura et al., 2008) and Jacobson (2011) concludes that traditional handling of

115 animal manure has the lowest costs and separation is difficult to justify unless the farm is situated  
116 in a very livestock intensive area where it is difficult to get rid of the slurry.

117  
118 In the Republic of Ireland a general response to the sector's concerns was that the pig and  
119 poultry sectors could shift the focus of land spreading to arable areas. The argument for an  
120 arable land based solution to the issue of pig/poultry manure holds that with 10 per cent of the  
121 national land area in crop production, there should be land available<sup>4</sup> to take the national output  
122 from pig and poultry producers. In response the pig and poultry sectors argued that the  
123 concentration of the industry in the border region of Ireland (bordering Northern Ireland) and  
124 the lack of arable land in this region could lead to the demise of these industries.

125  
126 There were 1.62 million pigs in the Republic of Ireland in 2007 (CSO, 2008). The border region<sup>5</sup>  
127 accounted for 30 percent of the total pig population while the south west and south east  
128 accounted for 22 and 19 per cent respectively. The total poultry population was 11.9 million  
129 birds (CSO, 2008) and was dominated by the border region which accounted for 64 per cent of  
130 the total population. 375,000 hectares is devoted to cereal or root crops in the Republic of  
131 Ireland in 2009 (CSO, 2011a), approximately 10 per cent of this production takes place in the  
132 border region. The main cereal or root crop producing regions are the south east (32 per cent),  
133 mid-east (23 per cent) and the south west (17 per cent) as outlined in Table 1.

134  
135 **Table 1: Regional distribution of pig, poultry and arable production across the Republic of**  
136 **Ireland**

Region	Pig Population	Poultry population	Cereals & root crops area
Border	30%	64%	10%
South-West	22%	8%	17%
South-East	19%	9%	32%

<sup>4</sup>There is no geographical restriction on recipient spread lands.

<sup>5</sup>The regional composition is based on the NUTS (Nomenclature of Territorial Units) classification used by Eurostat. The NUTS3 regions correspond to the eight Regional Authorities established under the Local Government Act, 1991 (Regional Authorities) (Establishment) Order, 1993, which came into operation on 1 January 1994.

Midland	14%	1%	9%
Mid-West	6%	12%	4%
Mid East	5%	4%	23%
West	3%	2%	3%

137

138 It clear from Table 1 that the border region with 30 and 64 per cent of the pig and poultry  
 139 populations and 10 per cent of arable and root crop area has the greatest potential disparity  
 140 between supply of these manures and availability of recipient arable land locally. Historically,  
 141 grassland farms have been the main receptors of these manures in this region. However, with  
 142 the ending of the transitional arrangements in 2013, where these manures become subject to P  
 143 as well as N limits, recipient grassland farms maybe become more difficult to source.

144

145 A national survey of manure application and storage practices on Irish farms (Hennessy et al,  
 146 2011) reported that 4 per cent of all farmers' imported slurry and/or farmyard manure in 2009.  
 147 Of those importing, three-quarters reported importing pig slurry. The tillage farm system are  
 148 the most likely to be importing, almost 20 percent of tillage farmers report that they imported  
 149 organic fertilisers in 2009. Of these farms, 72 percent had imported pig slurry, 20 percent had  
 150 imported cattle slurry while the remaining 8 percent had imported poultry manure.

151 It is estimated that pig manure generates approximately 13,500 tonnes of N and 2,600 tonnes of  
 152 P annually across the Republic of Ireland (Teagasc Pig Production Development Unit, 2009). This  
 153 is equivalent to 4.4 and 9.9 per cent of chemical N and P used on farms in the Republic of  
 154 Ireland (DAFF, 2009). A total of 172,735 tonnes of poultry litter is produced annually (Leahy et  
 155 al, 2006) it is estimated that this is equivalent to 2,708 tonnes of N and 1,120 tonnes of P based  
 156 on poultry production profile data (CSO, 2009) and associated average nutrient values (Coulter  
 157 and Lawlor, 2008). This corresponds to 0.8 and 4.2 per cent of chemical N and P used on farms  
 158 in the Republic of Ireland. The fertilizer replacement value of P for these manures is set at 100  
 159 per cent for P and 50 per cent for N under the regulations (Coulter and Lawlor, 2008) although N  
 160 availability maybe increased based on optimal application, timing and method.

161

162 Fealy et al., (2012) recently investigated the cost of transporting pig slurry to arable lands. They  
163 found that the average distance from a commercial pig unit to arable land was 21 kilometres.  
164 However, the counties with an average distance of less than 5 kilometres account for less than 7  
165 per cent of total sow numbers. At the other extreme, the border and western counties had  
166 average distances of over 20 kilometres and this area accounts for over one third of all sows.  
167 Cavan a county in the border region with nearly 20 per cent of the total sow population has an  
168 average distance of 56 kilometres. McCutcheon and Lynch (2008) suggested that, depending on  
169 the dry matter content, at distances of 25 to 100 kilometres<sup>6</sup> the marginal cost of the manure  
170 may exceed the nutrient benefit derived from importation. This will be influenced by prevailing  
171 chemical fertiliser and fuel prices.

172  
173 The decision to import pig and/or poultry manure is ultimately dependant on the nutrient value  
174 of the manure; the cost of transport and application; and farmer preferences. The nutrient  
175 value of pig and poultry manure is dependant on the price of chemical fertilisers as there is  
176 direct substitution potential. Chemical fertiliser prices have been subject to significant price  
177 volatility over the last decade as indicated by an 80 per cent increase between 2005 and 2008,  
178 where record prices prevailed (CSOa, 2011). Sales of 308,960 tonnes of nitrogen and 26,350  
179 tonnes of P chemical fertilisers were recorded in 2008 (DAFF, 2009). Application rates of  
180 chemical N on grassland ranged from 106 kg N Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the south-east to 48 kg N Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the  
181 west and 75-76 N kg N Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the midlands and border regions. Cereal farms in the mid-east  
182 and border regions reported the highest level of chemical N applications at 159 and 151 kg N  
183 Ha<sup>-1</sup> respectively, compared to 84 kg N Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the south and 128 kg N Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the south-east.  
184 Average P applications on grassland were relatively uniform averaging 5 kg P Ha<sup>-1</sup> ranging from 6  
185 kg P Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the south-east to 4 kg P Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the west and mid-east. Chemical P application  
186 averaged 20 kg P Ha<sup>-1</sup> across cereal farms ranging from 17 kg P Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the mid-east to 24 kg P  
187 Ha<sup>-1</sup> in the south-west (Lalor et al., 2008).

188

---

<sup>6</sup> This range is based on dry matter content of between 3 to 6 per cent.

189 Farmers' nutrient management preferences will affect their willingness to import pig and  
190 poultry manures. Some farmers have express concern about handling pig and poultry slurry and  
191 the potential variability of nutrient content across these manures. In a tillage context,  
192 pig/poultry manure must be applied within a narrow time period, using specialist equipment,  
193 typically immediately before ploughing, hence the manure needs to be available on or close to  
194 the tillage farm at the appropriate time or storage facilities need to be available on tillage farms  
195 (Schulte et al., 2010). Livestock farmers have also expressed concerns around potential  
196 pathogens associated with these manures and many have traditional viewed these organic  
197 manures as a waste product to be disposed of more than a nutrient source (Burton and Turner,  
198 2003). On the positive side recent research has shown that pig slurry has the potential to offset  
199 crop stressors such as drought (Plunkett, 2011).

200  
201 Assuming farmer preferences are not biased against pig or poultry manure sources, economic  
202 rationality would suggest that they should consider importation of these manures if the cost of  
203 importation (nutrient value, transport and applications costs) is less than or equal to the  
204 equivalent cost of chemical fertilisers application. In this context this paper seeks to examine if  
205 there is a potential market for these organic manures and to investigate the farm and  
206 demographic variables which influence farmers' willingness to import these nutrient sources.

207

## 208 **2. Methodology**

209

210 The main data source employed in this analysis is a National Farm Survey (NFS) conducted in  
211 2007. This NFS is collected annually as part of the Farm Accountancy Data Network  
212 requirements of the European Union (Farm Accountancy Data Network (FADN), 2005). The  
213 purpose of FADN and the NFS is to collect and analyse information relating to farm activities,  
214 financial returns to agriculture and demographic characteristics. A farm accounts book is  
215 recorded on a random representative sample of farms throughout the Republic of Ireland. The  
216 sample is weighted to be representative of farming nationally across Ireland. In the 2007 NFS  
217 survey 1,151 farmers were surveyed representing 111,913 farmers nationally.

218

219 In addition to the main survey, additional special supplementary surveys on specific topics are  
220 conducted annually. Questions investigating farmers' willingness to import pig and poultry  
221 manures onto their land were included and conducted in conjunction with the regular NFS data  
222 collection schedule in autumn 2007. Interviews were undertaken on site by a team of trained  
223 NFS recorders. Not all the respondents from the main survey participated in the supplementary  
224 survey in 2007. Hence it was necessary to re-weight the sample to produce a matched balanced  
225 dataset. The final dataset used in this analysis consisted of 986 farmers which represents  
226 97,752 farmers when weighted and is still nationally representative at approximately 1% based  
227 on random sampling.

228

229 A multinomial logit model was used to investigate the willingness of farmers to import (WTI) pig  
230 and/or poultry manures. The landowner decision process had three exclusive outcomes,  
231 indexed by  $j \in J = \{0, 1, 2\}$ : not willing to import pig and/or poultry manures onto farm  
232 ( $j = 0$ ), willing to import pig and/or poultry on a free of charge basis where slurry, transport  
233 and spreading was free, ( $j = 1$ ) willing to import pig and/or poultry manures on a payment  
234 basis, where a farmer would pay towards slurry, transport and spreading ( $j = 2$ ). Assuming that  
235 the utility that landowner,  $n$ , derives from the chosen alternative,  $j$  (denoted  $U_{nj}$ ) can be  
236 written as (Long, 1997):

237

$$238 \quad U_{nj} = X_n \beta_j' + \varepsilon_{nj} \quad (1)$$

239

240 Where the deterministic part  $X_n \beta_j'$  relates to characteristics of the landowner and  $\varepsilon_{nj}$  is an  
241 error term. The framework is based on random utility theory (McFadden, 1973 and Pudney,  
242 1989). The probability that landowner  $n$  will select outcome  $j$  from outcome set  $J$  is then:

243

$$244 \quad \Pr_{nj} = P(j | J) = \Pr(X_n \beta_j' + \varepsilon_{nj} > X_n \beta_k' + \varepsilon_{nk}) \quad \forall k \in J, j \neq k \quad (2)$$

245

246 By using the logistic distribution the probability, Pr, that landowner  $n$  will choose alternative  $j$   
 247 can be written as (McFadden, 1973):

248

$$249 \quad \Pr(y_n = j) = \frac{\exp(x_n \beta_j)}{1 + \sum_k^K \exp(x_n \beta_k)} \quad (3)$$

250

251 The probabilities shown in equation (3) are those for the multinomial logit model (Long and  
 252 Freese, 2006). Interpretation of multinomial logit results requires that one potential outcome is  
 253 selected as the “default”, hence all coefficients for a characteristic group should be interpreted  
 254 as relative to a default category. In this application farmers not willing to import these manure  
 255 were set as the primary base category and the model investigates factors which influence  
 256 willingness to import these manure on a payment and free of charge basis.

257

### 258 3. Results

259

260 Descriptive analyses of results show that 58 per cent of the sample were not willing to import  
 261 pig slurry and 74 per cent were not willing to import poultry manure. A total of 15 and 9 per  
 262 cent indicated a WTI pig and poultry manure on a payment basis respectively, while 28 percent  
 263 indicated a willingness to import pig slurry only if offered on a free of charge basis while the  
 264 relevant statistic for poultry was 17 per cent as outlined in Table 2.

265

266 **Table 2: Willingness of farmers to import pig and poultry manures**

	Pig Manure		Poultry Manure	
	No.	%	No.	%
WTI on a payment basis	144	(15%)	92	(9%)
WTI on a free of charge basis	275	(28%)	167	(17%)
Not WTI	567	(58%)	727	(74%)
Total	986	(100%)	986	(100%)

267 A number of independent variables *a priori* could be expected to affect the probability that a  
 268 farmer is willingness to import these manures. These include age, expenditure on chemical  
 269 fertilisers, farm size, per cent of the farm under arable crops and whether the farm is subject to  
 270 Nitrates Directive derogation. These variables are included in the multinomial logit model and  
 271 descriptive statistics and a definition for these variables are given in Table 3.

272

273 **Table 3: Descriptive statistics for variables in multinomial logit model**

	Mean	S.D	Min	Max
Age (yrs)	56	12	22	86
Fertiliser expenditure (€ ha <sup>-1</sup> ) <sup>7</sup>	76	56	0	381
Farm size (ha)	33	29	3	346
Per cent of farm under cereal/root crops	4	13	0	100
Nitrates derogation (% of farmers)	7	26	0	1

274

275 The multinomial logit model requires that one potential outcome be selected as the default or  
 276 base category and outcomes for all other categories are interpreted relative to this base. The  
 277 base category for columns 1 and 2 in Tables 4 and 5 are those landowners who were not willing  
 278 to import these manures. Hence all coefficients should be interpreted as relative to this base  
 279 category. Column 3 has a base of WTI for free and compares this with farmers who are WTI on  
 280 a payment basis.

281

### 282 **3.1 Willingness to import pig manure**

283 Age was found to be negatively associated with WTI pig manure both on a payment and free of  
 284 charge basis. Younger farmers tend to be more aware of the nutrient value and potential of  
 285 these manures and hence more likely to import. Pig slurry is a direct substitute for chemical  
 286 fertilisers and results indicate that farmers who are applying greater quantities of chemical  
 287 fertiliser as measured here by fertiliser expenditure per hectare are significantly more likely to  
 288 be willing to import pig slurry on a payment basis. Farm size is positively related to WTI (free

<sup>5</sup> Average fertiliser € ha<sup>-1</sup> among tillage farmers in the sample was €132 ha<sup>-1</sup>

289 and payment), this suggests larger more commercial farms are more willing to consider this  
 290 alternative.

291  
 292 Derogation farmers are prohibited from importing organic manure and results reflect this,  
 293 farmers not restricted under derogation were more likely to be WTI pig manure both on a free  
 294 of charge and payment basis. Finally, farms with larger proportions of land devoted to arable or  
 295 root crops were strongly associated with WTI on a payment basis, these farms are growing  
 296 crops with higher nutrient demand and can potentially utilise these manures most efficiently by  
 297 incorporation into soils at the cultivation stage.

298

299 **Table 4: Results of multinomial logit model examining landowner WTI pig manure**

<b>Variable</b>	<b>WTI – payment (Base =not willing to import) (1)</b>	<b>WTI - Free (Base=non willing to import) (2)</b>	<b>WTI – payment (Base = WTI - Free) (3)</b>
Age	-0.017 (0.01)*	-0.19 (0.09)**	0.001 (0.011)
Fertiliser expenditure € Ha <sup>-1</sup>	0.003 (0.002)*	0.002 (0.002)	0.0011 (0.0018)
Farm size (hectares)	0.01 (0.005)**	0.01 (0.004)***	-0.001 (0.004)
Nitrates derogation	-0.9 (0.42)**	-0.85 (0.35)**	-0.019 (0.459)
% of farm under arable crops	1.53 (0.63)**	0.41 (0.66)	1.05 (0.65)*
Constant	-1.38 (0.54)**	-0.56 (0.50)	-0.88 (0.594)
Log pseudo-likelihood	-842.61		

Wald chi2	37.89
-----------	-------

300 (N=975) Standard errors are given in parenthesis under co-efficients. Individual co-efficients are statistically  
 301 significant at the \*10% level; \*\*5% level; \*\*\*1% level.

302  
 303 A Wald test was performed to test whether the parameters of the model are all equal to zero.  
 304 The Wald  $\chi^2$  statistic shows that, taken jointly, the coefficients for this model specification are  
 305 significant at the 1% level.

307 **3.2 Willingness to import poultry manure**

308 Results for WTI poultry manure follow a similar pattern to that for pig manure, however the  
 309 relationships were not seen to be as strong statistically. Age was again found to be negatively  
 310 associated with WTI poultry manure as were restrictions under a Nitrates Directive derogation.  
 311 Farm size was again positively related to WTI, particularly for those WTI on a free of charge  
 312 basis. Results indicate that farmers with higher levels of expenditure on chemical fertiliser per  
 313 hectare are more likely to be WTI, but the relationship was not statistically significant. As  
 314 before farms with a greater percent of land under arable crops are significantly associated with  
 315 WTI on a payment basis compared to the other two groups.

317 **Table 5: Results of multinomial logit model examining landowner WTI poultry manure**

Variable	WTI – payment (Base =not willing to import) (1)	WTI - Free (Base=non willing to import) (2)	WTI – payment (Base = WTI - Free) (3)
Age	-0.003 (0.01)	-0.12 (0.011)	0.008 (0.15)
Fertiliser expenditure € Ha <sup>-1</sup>	0.002 (0.002)	0.0005 (0.002)	0.001 (0.003)
Farm size (hectares)	0.008	0.012	-0.004

	(0.006)	(0.004)***	(0.005)
Nitrates derogation	-0.59	-0.72	0.13
	(0.6)	(0.38)**	(0.67)
% of farm under arable crops	1.9	0.34	1.56
	(0.67)***	(0.64)	(0.72)**
Constant	-2.47	-1.43	-1.00
	(0.636)***	(0.58)**	(0.762)
Log pseudo-likelihood	-660.74		
Wald chi2	30.95		

318 (N=975) Standard errors are given in parenthesis under co-efficients. Individual co-efficients are statistically  
319 significant at the \*10% level; \*\*5% level; \*\*\*1% level.

320  
321 The Wald  $\chi^2$  statistic again shows that, taken jointly, the coefficients for this model specification  
322 are significant at the 1% level.

323

#### 324 4. Discussion and Conclusions

325

326 Assuming no decrease in production, farms with excessive N and P need to export surpluses,  
327 this is either potentially a cost to the system or a benefit if a willing buyer can be located. The  
328 long term price outlook for chemical fertiliser is unclear but future energy prices and growing  
329 demand from emerging economies would tend to suggest strong future demand with upward  
330 price pressure (Heffer and Prud'homme, 2010). This may make the economics of importing pig  
331 and poultry manure attractive.

332

333 Results from this study indicate that demand for importation of pig and poultry manures is  
334 generally highest among younger farmers of larger farm size with greater expenditure on  
335 chemical fertilisers per hectare who are not restricted by nitrates derogation and who are  
336 arable orientated. The desirability of pig and poultry manure as an imported farm nutrient  
337 source will depend on a number of factors including the price of chemical fertilisers, transport  
338 and application costs and farmers nutrient preferences. A large number of farmers in this

339 sample indicated that they would not be willing to import these manures even if offered them  
340 on a free of charge basis. Issues around nutrient variability of these manures, tight windows for  
341 application and specialist equipment necessary for application have been cited as potential  
342 constraints (Vermeire et al. 2009 ; Schulte et al., 2010). More research is needed to examine the  
343 rationale behind this preference. Farmers in this study were not asked how much they would  
344 be willing to pay to import pig and poultry manures; additional research is also required to  
345 establish these price schedules as it may be that farmers value these manures at less or more  
346 than chemical nutrient sources.

347  
348 Pig and poultry farmers across the Republic of Ireland have expressed concerns that the phasing  
349 out of the transitional arrangements for land spreading of manures from these sectors will pose  
350 significant difficulties with associated production cost implications. However, results from this  
351 analysis indicate there is a potential market for these manures across the Republic of Ireland  
352 which could be revenue generating as there is a cohort or mainly arable farmers who are willing  
353 to import these manures on a payment basis. Historically these manures were supplied to  
354 recipient farmers free of charge, but with the increase in chemical fertiliser prices a market has  
355 developed for these manures. Depending on local supply and demand conditions these  
356 manures can be revenue generating or at least have cost sharing around transportation and  
357 spreading (Carroll, 2012). The market for these manures at present is in its infancy and tends to  
358 be between local farmers of relative close proximity based on word of mouth and some third  
359 party farm advisory facilitation. If chemical fertiliser prices continue in an upward trend and  
360 with the ending of the transitional arrangements a more nationally based market may well  
361 emerge where these manures are traded much as other agricultural commodities are at  
362 present. However, the export and trade of these manures maybe constrained by regional  
363 disparities between supply and demand. Beyond 30 kilometres the transport and spreading  
364 costs exceed the nutrient value (Fealy et al., 2012). Exporters of these manures in the southern  
365 and eastern regions are generally located close to potential arable spread lands and below this  
366 threshold. However, in the pig and poultry intensive border region average distance are over  
367 double the 30 kilometre which would involve cost subsidisation by exporters. Unless grassland

368 recipient spread lands are available locally, then these exporters are faced with reducing  
369 production, subsidising manure redistribution or investing in processing technology as happens  
370 in Netherland, Belgium, Denmark, Italy and Spain (Burton and Turner, 2003). Recent analysis in  
371 the Republic of Ireland suggests that spreading pig manure on land is still the most economic  
372 way of utilising it and that transporting the manure over long distances still compares more  
373 favourably than the processing technology alternatives currently available (Teagasc Pig  
374 Development Department, 2011).

375  
376 There is potentially a role for regulators and agricultural agencies in assisting this market to  
377 develop. It's clear from this research that demand is strongest among arable farms and this will  
378 most likely be reflected in the price they are willing to pay for these nutrient sources.  
379 Additionally, depending on the prevailing soil type and hydrology of recipient lands this could  
380 prove an environmentally positive outcome as these systems are best able to utilise these  
381 manures both from an agronomic and eco-efficiency perspective and could reduce the risk of  
382 nutrient loss to the wider water environment and assist in achieving environmental goals under  
383 the EU Nitrates and Water Framework Directives.

384

## 385 **5. Acknowledgements**

386 This research was funded by the Department of Agriculture, Marine and Food, Republic of  
387 Ireland.

388

## 389 **6. References**

- 390 Adhikari, M., Paudel, K.P., Martin, N.R.J., Gauthier, W.M., 2005. Economics of dairy waste use  
391 as fertilizer in central Texas. *Waste Management*, 25 (10), 1067-107.
- 392 Biberacher, M., Warnecke, S., Brauckmann, H.J., Broll, G., 2009. *A linear optimisation model for*  
393 *animal farm manure transports in regions with high intensity animal farming*, 18th  
394 World IMACS / MODSIM Congress, Cairns, Australia.
- 395 Burton, C. H., Turner, C., 2003. *Manure management: treatment strategies for sustainable*  
396 *agriculture*. Quae Editions.
- 397 Carroll, C., 2012. Personal Communication – Head of Teagasc Pig Development Unit.
- 398 Central Statistics Office, 2008. *Farm Structured Survey 2007*. Available at: <<http://www.cso.ie>

399 /releasespublications/documents/agriculture/2007/farmstructure\_2007.pdf> [Accessed  
400 22.07.11].

401 Central Statistics Office, 2011a. *Area Farmed in June by Region, Type of Land Use and Year*.  
402 Available at: <[http://www.cso.ie/px/pxeirestat/Statire/SelectVarVal/Define.asp?maintable](http://www.cso.ie/px/pxeirestat/Statire/SelectVarVal/Define.asp?maintable=AQA01&PLanguage=0)  
403 [=AQA01&PLanguage=0](http://www.cso.ie/px/pxeirestat/Statire/SelectVarVal/Define.asp?maintable=AQA01&PLanguage=0)> [Accessed 26.10.11].

404 Central Statistics Office, 2011b. *Fertiliser prices*. Available at: <<http://www.cso.ie/px/pxeirestat/Dialog/Saveshow.asp>> [Accessed 15.07.11].

406 Coulter, B.S., Lalor, S., 2008. *Major and micro nutrient advice for productive agricultural crops*.  
407 Teagasc, Johnstown Castle, Wexford, Ireland.

408 Department of Agriculture, Fisheries and Food, Dublin, 2009. *Fertiliser Consumption, 1989-2008*.  
409 Farm Accountancy Data Network, 2005. Concept of FADN. Available at:  
410 <<http://europa.eu.int/comm/agriculture/rica>. [Accessed 15.04.11].

411 Fealy, R. M., Buckley, C., Mechan, S., Melland, A. Mellander, P. E., Shortle, G., Wall, D. and  
412 Jordan, P., 2010. The Irish Agricultural Catchments Programme: catchments selection using  
413 spatial multi-criteria decision analysis. *Soil Use and Management*, 26, 225–236.

414 Fealy, R., O'Donoghue, C., Hanrahan, K., Martin, M. and Rogier P.O. Schulte, R.P.O., 2012.  
415 Modelling the Gross Cost of Transporting Pig Slurry to Tillage Spread Lands in a Post  
416 Transition Arrangement within the Nitrates Directive. *Rural Economy and Development*  
417 *Working Paper 12-WP-RE-04*. Teagasc, Athenry, Republic of Ireland.

418 Government of Ireland, 2006. *European Communities (Good Agricultural Practice for Protection*  
419 *of Waters) Regulations (2006)*. S.I. No. 378 of 2006. Published by the Stationery Office,  
420 Government Publications Office, Dublin

421 Government of Ireland, 2009. *European Communities (Good Agricultural Practice for Protection*  
422 *of Waters) Regulations (2009)*. S.I. No. 101 of 2009. Published by the Stationery Office,  
423 Government Publications Office, Dublin

424 Government of Ireland, 2010. *European Communities (Good Agricultural Practice for Protection*  
425 *of Waters) Regulations (2010)*. S.I. No. 610 of 2010. Published by the Stationery Office,  
426 Government Publications Office, Dublin

427 Heffer, P., and Prud'homme, M., 2011. *Fertilizer Outlook 2011 – 2015*. Proceeding International  
428 Fertilizer Industry Association, 79th IFA Annual Conference, 23-25 May, Montreal, Canada.  
429 Available at: <[http://www.fertilizer.org/ifa/HomePage/LIBRARY/Conference-papers/Annual-](http://www.fertilizer.org/ifa/HomePage/LIBRARY/Conference-papers/Annual-Conferences/2011-IFA-Annual-Conference)  
430 [Conferences/2011-IFA-Annual-Conference](http://www.fertilizer.org/ifa/HomePage/LIBRARY/Conference-papers/Annual-Conferences/2011-IFA-Annual-Conference)> [Accessed 15.07.11].

431 Hennessy, T., Buckley, C., Cushion, M., Kinsella, A., Moran, B., 2011. *National Farm Survey of*  
432 *Manure Application and Storage Practices on Irish Farms*. Teagasc, Athenry, County Galway.

433 Jacobson, B., 2011. Costs of slurry separation technologies and alternative use of the solid  
434 fraction for biogas production or burning – a Danish perspective. *International Journal of*  
435 *Agricultural Management*, 1(2), 11-22.

436 Langeveld, J.W.A., Verhagen, A., Neeteson, J.J., van Keulen, H., Conijn, J.G., Schils, R.L. M.,  
437 Oenema, J., 2007. Evaluating farm performance using agri-environmental indicators:  
438 Recent experiences for nitrogen management in The Netherlands. *Journal of*  
439 *Environmental Management*, 82(3), 363-376.

440 Leahy, M. J., Kelleher, B. P., Henihan, A. M. and Leahy, J.J. and O'Connor, J., 2006. *Mitigation of*  
441 *large-scale organic waste damage incorporating a demonstration of a closed loop conversion*  
442 *of poultry waste to energy at the point of source*. Report prepared for the Environmental  
443 Protection Agency. Available at: <[http://www.epa.ie/downloads/pubs/research](http://www.epa.ie/downloads/pubs/research/waste/poultry%20epa%20draft%20final%20report%202000-ls-1-m22.pdf)  
444 [/waste/poultry%20epa%20draft%20final%20report%202000-ls-1-m22.pdf](http://www.epa.ie/downloads/pubs/research/waste/poultry%20epa%20draft%20final%20report%202000-ls-1-m22.pdf)>  
445 [Accessed 15.07.11].

446 Long, S.J., 1997. *Regression models for categorical and limited dependant variables*. Sage,  
447 California, USA.

448 Long, S.J., Freese, J., 2006. *Regression models for categorical dependent variables using stata*.  
449 Stata Press, Texas, USA.

450 Lopez-Ridaura, S., Deltour, L., Paillat, J.M., van der Werf, H.M.G., 2008. *Comparing options for*  
451 *pig slurry management by Life Cycle Assessment*, 6th International Conference on Life  
452 Cycle Assessment in the Agri-Food Sector Zurich, Switzerland.

453 McCutcheon, G., and Lynch, B., 2008. *Pig manure – an asset to be managed*. Proceedings from  
454 the Teagasc National Pig conference 2008. Available at: [http://www.teagasc.ie/](http://www.teagasc.ie/pigs/conf_proceedings/pigconferenceproceedings08.pdf)  
455 [pigs/conf\\_proceedings/pigconferenceproceedings08.pdf](http://www.teagasc.ie/pigs/conf_proceedings/pigconferenceproceedings08.pdf) [Accessed 22.07.11].

456 McFadden, D., 1973. Conditional logit analysis of qualitative choice behavior. In: P Zarembka,  
457 ed. *Frontiers in Econometrics*. Academic Press, New York, USA.

458 Morgan, M.F., 1941. Chemical Soil Diagnosis by the Universal Soil Testing System. Connecticut  
459 Agricultural Experimental Station Bulletin 450.

460 Paudel, K.P., Bhattarai, K., Gauthier, W.M., Hall, L.M., 2009. Geographic information systems  
461 (GIS) based model of dairy manure transportation and application with environmental  
462 quality consideration. *Waste Management*, 29 (5), 1634-1643.

463 Paudel, K.P., McIntosh, C.S., 2005. Country report: Broiler industry and broiler litter-related  
464 problems in the southeastern United States. *Waste Management*, 25 (10), 1083-1088.

465 Plunkett, M., 2011. Slurry applied to spring crops is showing a double benefit. *Irish Farmers*  
466 *Journal*, 14 May 2011.

467 Pudney, S., 1989. *Modelling individual choice*. Basil Blackwell, New York, USA.

468 Schroder, J.J., Verloop, J., 2010. *Slurry separation could allow a wider use of manure within the*  
469 *EU Nitrates Directive*, 4th Ramiran International Conference, Lisbon, Portugal.

470 Schulte, R.P.O., Gibson, M.T., Lalor, S.T.J., Hacket, R. et al, 2010. *Independent review of the*  
471 *science, implementation and administration of the Draft European Communities (Good*  
472 *Agricultural Practice for Protection of Waters) Regulations 2010*. Carlow: Teagasc,  
473 Agriculture and Food Development Authority.

474 Teagasc Pig Production Development Unit, 2009. A Development strategy for the Irish Pig  
475 Industry 2008 to 2015. Available at: <[http://www.teagasc.ie/pigs/advisory\\_services/  
476 Strategy\\_group\\_report\\_Final\\_08.pdf](http://www.teagasc.ie/pigs/advisory_services/Strategy_group_report_Final_08.pdf)> [Accessed 03.11.11].

477 Teagasc, 2010. National Farm Survey data. Personal communication – National Farm survey  
478 Department.

479 Teagasc, 2011. Pig Development Department Research Dissemination Day Research Results on  
480 Alternative Uses for Pig Manure. Fermoy, Ireland.

481 Teira-Esmatges, M.R., Flotats, X., 2003. A method for livestock waste management planning in  
482 NE Spain. *Waste Management*, 23 (10), 917-932.

483 Van der Straeten, B., Buysse, J., Nolte, S., Lauwers, L., Claeys, D., Van Huylenbroeck, G., 2010. A  
484 multi-agent simulation model for spatial optimisation of manure allocation. *Journal of*  
485 *Environmental Planning and Management*, 53(8), 1011-1030.

486 Vermeire, B., Viaene, J., Gellynck, X., 2009. Effect of Uncertainty on farmers decision making:  
487 case of animal manure use. *Applied Studies in Agribusiness and Commerce*, 3(5-6), 7-13.

488 Warneck, S., Biberacher, M., Brackmann, H.J. and Broll, G., 2010. Nutrient best management  
489 practices need regional material flow management for soil protection. *World Congress of*  
490 *Soil Science*. Brisbane, Australia, August 1-6.